



Nighat Rasheed<sup>1</sup>, Ammar Yasir<sup>2</sup>

## Abstract

According to research, a conflict scenario occurs between the state and ethnic groups, where the state rejects call for political power sharing or adequate representation in political and administrative institutions. It is also explicitly stated that the meaning of ethnic politics is determined by political, economic, and social issues. The researcher identified four indicators to measure the threat to Pakistan's national integration, besides highlighting the elements causing ethnic politics and conflict environment. A detailed survey of three ethnic groups from the three provinces of Punjab, Sindh and Baluchistan was also included in the study. The investigation concludes that a specific structural and perceptual point of view needs to be created to promote national integration. The role of the state is key to achieving this goal. In pluralistic societies like Pakistan, political engagement, political reforms and social giving can bring about change instead of clinging to old restrictive regimes.

**Keywords:** conflict scenario, state, ethnic groups, political power sharing, representation, national integration, ethnic politics, political engagement, political reforms, social giving.

Nationalism and national integration have significant importance in playing its role in modeling social values and contributing to national development. Nationalism is a sense of pride among diverse groups of society. As a nation, they respect their cultural, religion and social differences, often serve as a unifying force to achieve their shared goal. This shared identity serves as a force to develop the sense of belongingness among diverse groups of nation. Without nationalism national integration cannot be achieved in a nation-state. National integration leads to the inoculation of social values such as tolerance, unity in diverse groups of nation states, accomplishment of justice in a society, provision of equal rights and civic responsibility. It diminished the racism among nation state and creates a base for social cohesion and stability. This, in turn, positively impacts national development by promoting inclusivity, reducing internal conflicts, and facilitating collaboration among diverse groups. There are certain unique characteristics and similarities between the three selected case studies. The three ethnic groups differ in that they are part of different social frameworks. The Mohajirs are an urban community with no historical ties to any of the territory they currently live in, the Saraiki's are an exclusively agrarian society with strong ties to their language and culture, and the Baloch are part of a tribal system with strong territorial associations. As for their grievances, we address them in detail in this study. In this case, it is most important to talk about the similarities between these groups.

- Their language relationship is relevant to their first common features. They are often referred to as linguistic identities because they believe that language is a key indicator of identity.

- The three ethnic groups started their campaign to preserve their distinct identity.

- Another problem is that these ethnic groups are more concerned about the state than internal conflicts, and that is why the Baloch, Muhajir and Saraiki groups have started their activities in response to government policies.

- The final element is intra-ethnic division; even though their languages and cultures are similar, they disagree on small things. The study showed that state officials often use these intra-ethnic conflicts to divide the power of ethnic groups. The main claim of the research is that the state has a significant influence on the development of ethnic politics. Ethnic groups are mobilized either positively or negatively in response to state involvement. So, the state is the one who caused the conflict. Another crucial point is that ethnic conflict should be understood as a struggle with the state rather than a dispute between or among ethnic groups. The current study examines ethnic conflict in a conflict environment where the state significantly influences the emergence and development of conflict. State and government are terms that are used synonymously in this sense. Although many academics choose to believe that the state is a set of organizations that exercise authority over society. However, the researcher thinks that neither the state nor the government can function without the other; rather, they are interdependent. Therefore, both are used in the same way.

## Literature Review

### Rise of nationalism in Pakistan

Recent study concluded that the Pashtun Tahafuz (protection) movement is one of the strong waves of nationalism that Pakistan is currently dealing with. Pakistan is witnessing the emergence of a marginal nationalist movement not for the first time. Ever since its founding in 1947, Pakistan has had to deal with a number of issues resulting from ethnic movements. The sub-nationalist movement led by Bengalis broke up Pakistan in 1971. The political

<sup>1</sup> Business School, Riphah International University, Lahore. Email id nighat.rasheed@outlook.com

<sup>2</sup> Independent Researcher

landscape has been impacted by the separatist demands in Baluchistan and Sindh. In the wake of the war on terrorism, Pashtun nationalism is becoming a new and formidable issue in Pakistan's modern political and social environment (Ahmed & Khan, 2020).

Another study looked at the reasons behind the perceived severity of religious intolerance among Pakistan's various religious communities. Four religious' groups—Sunni, Shiite, Ahmadiyya and Christian—represent 199 university students who answered a questionnaire assessing religious intolerance. In addition to questions on the level of intolerance, the following seven scales were used to assess potential causes: influence of the curriculum in schools, ignorance of other groups, influence of hate literature, lack of social justice, peer and family pressure, history, media, external power influence and history. All categories of respondents agreed that Ahmadis is a target of extreme religious intolerance. Opinions varied with respect to other religious groups. The seven reasons for religious intolerance were ranked lower by Sunni respondents than by others. While Ahmadis and Christians ranked hate literature as the primary cause of religious intolerance, Sunni and Shia respondents ranked the influence of the school curriculum as the single most significant factor. The findings imply that more investigation into societal variables that can lessen religious intolerance in Pakistan is necessary. The perspectives of many religious communities must be considered (Khan, 2023).

#### **Importance of National integration in social values**

The desire for national integration has not diminished in any of the fractured post-colonial states. Despite various tactics and plans for national integration, things remained complicated. Pakistan is another country that has problems integrating into the country. These problems stem from conflicts within the social and political pillars of Pakistani society that have been mismanaged. Based on its ethnic composition, Pakistani society has been divided into several divisions. In order to increase and consolidate its authoritarian position, the state introduced an authoritarian program. Ethnic communities fueled campaigns to preserve their identity and launched ethnic politics in response to authoritarian policies. Ultimately, these ethnic movements pose a threat to the process of national integration. The findings suggest that a pluralistic approach should be used to promote national integration and assimilationist strategies should be avoided. The role of the central government can ease tensions and make the process of national integration more optimistic (Hashmi, 2014).

Pakistan is fortunate to have a large number of interstate 1 religions. Conflicts between communities and religions shouldn't result from Pakistan's diverse cultural and religious legacy, which enhances its cosmopolitan past. Regrettably, Pakistan now lacks tolerance for religious minorities. When Pakistan was initially founded, Muhammad Ali Jinnah envisioned a diverse, accepting nation; now things are very different. Extremist groups exploit minorities and are hostile to certain segments of society, excluding religious minorities from the majority based solely on their religious beliefs. The younger generation of the nation must be taught that both Islam and the national constitution strive for the nation-state to treat religious minorities fairly and provide them

with justice, as this is necessary for the establishment of national integration (Mehfooz, 2021).

National integration can only be supported by regional political stability and socio-economic progress. In particular, the history of Pakistan and the world at large tells us that the state has always been ruined by central government bias in politics and administration, as well as unequal distribution of natural or man-made resources. Baluchistan must implement political, social and fiscal policies to achieve national integration, peace and prosperity. Regaining the confidence of the Baloch people is a crucial step towards progress in the development of Baluchistan. The federal government would like to hold talks with the tribal chiefs of Baluchistan's ethnic groups, known as sardars. (Tabassum, 2020).

#### **Importance of Education in national integration**

Research was conducted to examine Pakistan's current educational system. Pakistan's educational policies have great potential for bringing about revolutionary socio-economic transformation in the nation through education. Since its independence in 1947, Pakistan has struggled with a shortage of trained teachers and an inadequate number of educational institutions. Many educational policies were released in order to address issues in education. The policies arrived with a variety of policy documents at various points in time and under various regimes. Their size, goal, and level of seriousness differed. It is believed that Pakistan's current educational system fails to meet country's demand for high-quality instruction. Concerns and challenges pertaining to teaching and learning are numerous (Amir, 2020).

Another study highlighted that a major hindrance facing Pakistan is the lack of opportunities for secularism and religious plurality. Islamization of Pakistan's educational system is one of the biggest problems facing the nation. Starting with the first military dictatorship in the 1960s, a number of policy measures made by Pakistani governments have directly led to the current condition of things. This article looks at Pakistan's legislative and constitutional rules, its education strategy, and the effects of Islamization. This study also looks at the curricula that Pakistan's different educational districts uses. According to the study's findings, Pakistan's educational system strives to create Muslims rather than intelligent, global citizens (Li, 2023).

Pakistan is still sharply divided along many ideology, beliefs, ethnicity, regionalism, provincialism, and socioeconomic strata, even though the country is celebrating seven decades of freedom. Even though education is usually a key component in nation-building, Pakistan suffers from the unfavorable effect of educational divides escalating social differences. The objective of this research is to evaluate the effects of educational stratification on Pakistan's process of nation-building. Specifically, four major educational systems will be examined: army public schools, privately managed schools, public schools, and madrasas (religious educational institutions). Four major themes emerged from the examination of focus group data using the grounded approach theory: uneven opportunities, political and bureaucratic participation, lack of curriculum consistency, and a lack of moral instruction. The findings underscore the urgent need for a uniform educational system that provides equal learning opportunities to

every child, irrespective of caste, religion, language, economic class, political affiliation, or ethnicity (Mangi, 2021).

The importance of excellence in education for the sustainable development of Pakistan has been illustrated in a study paper. The researcher collected secondary time series data from World Development Indicators, IMF, World Bank, Asian Development Bank, United Nations Development Program and Pakistan Economic Survey. The data covered 28 years, from 1990 to 2018. Student teacher ratio, population growth, secondary school enrollment, education expenditure as a share of GDP and HDI were considered as independent variables. We used data analysis, ARDL and ECM models, ADF and bound tests, and correlation analysis. Our results show a strong, long-term relationship between quality education and sustainable development (Awan, 2020).

### **National integration in prejudice**

A study was conducted to review and the literature on Pakistan's Muslim majority's attitudes towards religious minorities. A concluding section Themes were created specifically for analysis using the analysis approach. The publishing years of studies and papers addressing Pakistani attitudes towards minorities were restricted. This paper reviewed the data generated starting in 2011 in this regard. The body of research indicates that scholars generally agree that Pakistan's religious minorities face discrimination and injustices that have a significant negative influence on their quality of life. These studies do not, however, address bias based on religion or culture (Rahman, 2021).

Another study confirmed a "pyramid of hate" view point on the problems and difficulties minority religious communities face in social and political environments that legitimise hatred. Previous studies demonstrate that negative social preconceptions and biases, in conjunction with state policies and practices that are not inclusive, foster an environment that legitimizes public animosity towards a minority community. This paper makes the case that understanding the many levels of hate biased attitudes, biased acts, discrimination, and violence will help us better understand such cultures of hate both inside and outside of the workplace. In its most extreme form, this kind of atmosphere could result in genocide and random killings. The study reveals a variety of experiences that Shia professionals and employees in Pakistan face, ranging from mild prejudice and stereotyping to overt harassment, discrimination, and violence. The study is distinctive in that it examines issues of bias, discrimination, and violence within a single religion based on a person's religious sect while integrating the concept of the pyramid of hate into management and organization studies (Syed, 2021).

Another research study examines Pakistan's high-quality education system in the context of global commitments, particularly the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) that pertain to education. That study paper focused on the obstacles that keep decision-makers and the government from eliminating the things that incite hatred against people who have different identities, whether they be linguistic, religious, or ethnic. The main suggestion of the UN Committees on several treaties for Pakistan was to review textbooks and curricula in order to remove any content that is biased and incites hatred towards other religions. In

order to ensure that everyone receives an impartial education in accordance with constitutional commitments, this research study navigates diverse policy frameworks adopted under various regimes and the objectives of political decision-makers (Awan S. A., 2023).

### **Role of social values and education in national development**

Social value production and sustainability have benefited from cross-cultural interactions between residents and visitors. The current study looked at how social entrepreneurship and cultural tourism affect the creation of social value and environmental sustainability. As researchers approached visitors to the tourist spots, they used a non-probabilistic convenience sampling strategy to draw a sample for the study in order to acquire the needed data. The study presents information gathered with the assistance of visitors to Pakistan's Gilgit-Baltistan region who are interested in cultural heritage. The PLS\_SEM technique was used in the study to analysis and generate the results. The results demonstrated a strong correlation between environmental sustainability, cultural tourism, and social value generation, which in turn strongly predicts environmental sustainability (Li X. A., et al., 2022).

A man's potential is developed through education, which also enables him to concentrate his efforts towards any objective he chooses. Men, not money, are the makers of nations, and education creates men. The reason instructors and educators were held in such high regard in antiquity and continue to be somewhat revered in modern times is due to the significant role that education plays in the growth of a nation. Working power or a nation's efficacy depends on vocational education. Teachers, scientists, doctors, and engineers are the sources of this type of education. Vocational education is essential for the construction of massive buildings, massive dams, roads, fighting illiteracy and disease, creating new innovations, harnessing the power of nature, trading, and banking systems.

All these things will stop if education is unable to supply them with people. Vocational training is necessary for all the luxuries and conveniences of life, including railroads, aeroplanes, ships, tube wells, and tractors used for farming and soil irrigation. Those are educational, social or political factors. Every nation has a society, and every man must live in that society. Then, every nation or country on the planet is a political entity. A country learns how to maintain political connections and coexist with others through social and political education.

In today's world, no nation can prosper without the backing of its neighbors, just like in a family. National growth is necessary for international cooperation and cannot occur without it. Furthermore, without education, a developed society is impossible. Social education is essential for maintaining social harmony and stability, which is essential for the growth and prosperity of the country. The value of education in raising national growth is demonstrated once more (Jahantab, 2021).

### **Research Methodology**

The present study is based on secondary data collection. Because in secondary method we collect data information that has already been collected and stored in a data base. It is also based on Quantitative research. It is a research strategy that focuses on qualifying the collection analysis of data. It is formed from a

deductive approach. We can fill questionnaire with agree or disagree from general public according to our research. The approach I study with a deductive approach. In this approach, we have given theory then we hypothesis, read and understand carefully then collect data according to the theory and give confirmation. Positivism research philosophy has been chosen that is originated in the natural sciences and focuses on scientific testing of hypothesis and finding logical proof that derives from statistical analysis. From the above approaches and research strategies I choose cross-section amount of time. It suits on a type of observational study designs that involves looking at data from a population at one specific point in time. After data competition, the sample size of 100 from general public. Research on national integration typically involves a multidisciplinary approach. Common methodologies include surveys, interviews, content analysis of media, and historical analysis. Quantitative data may be collected to measure societal attitudes, while qualitative methods help understand narratives and experiences shaping national identity. Collaborative efforts with diverse communities and experts can enrich the research, fostering a holistic understanding of factors influencing national integration.

### Theoretical Framework

The debate on national integration in Pakistan gained momentum as a result of the Baluchistan leadership's rejection of the federal government's initiatives. Since independence, they have been trying to establish their hegemony in their area without any interference from the government. The movement in the last years of British rule in the subcontinent is led by the Balochis. They were taken by surprise when Baluchistan was incorporated into Pakistan in 1947. The aim of the central government is to grab all the power of the sardar system and eradicate it from Baluchistan. The central government wanted to understand Pakistan's inclusion of Baluchistan. Currently, 55,000 Baloch are engaged in fighting with the formations of the Pakistani army. The same circumstances existed in 1973. The Baloch separatist organization acquired its special peculiarity in the 1960s; one must bear in mind its extreme modernism. During the 1962 battle, the army began to strengthen its position in Baluchistan. In 1963, 22 places with different areas covered a huge part of the province; the site was associated with the "Mengal Group" in the south and the "Marri Group" in the north. Numerous "volunteers" have taken care of everything and are inspiring others to join the fight against the federal government. Title "Baloch People's Liberation Front. The political leaders of Balochistan who are now in action are planning to follow the path of Marx and Lenin for the liberation of the state. The Baloch under "Sher Muhammad Mari's" leadership were incited and completed the task in about two years which eventually became the primary organization and function of the 1973 insurgency. The Pakistani government stated that the Baloch problem was the result of the self-centeredness of some Baloch leaders who were against progress of Balochistan. About twenty-eight Baloch figures, influential in Balochistan, have expressed their hostility to the central government.

### Data Analysis

**Table 1: Age of Respondents**

Age	Count of Age	Percentage
1	9	13.43
2	39	58.21
3	15	5.97
4	4	5.97
Grand Total	67	100

In the provided table, there is information about the distribution of individuals based on age and gender. The age distribution indicates that the majority fall into category 2 (39 individuals), representing 58.21% of the total count. Categories 1, 3, and 4 have 9, 15, and 4 individuals, respectively.

**Table 2: Gender of Respondents**

Gender	Count of Gender	Percentage
1	45	67.16
2	22	32.84
Grand Total	67	100

In terms of gender, 67.16% are in category 1 (presumably male), and 32.84% are in category 2 (presumably female). The table provides a clear breakdown of the count and percentage of individuals within each age and gender category, offering insights into the demographic composition of the studied population.

**Table 3: National Identity**

Row Labels	Count of Age	Percentage
1	13	19.40%
2	8	11.94%
3	46	68.66%
Grand Total	67	100.00%

The responses are categorized into three levels: Category 1 (34 individuals) signifies a belief that such strong affiliations do weaken the sense of nationhood, representing 50.75% of the total count. Category 2 (25 individuals) suggests a neutral stance, constituting 37.31%. Category 3 (8 individuals) indicates a belief that strong affiliations do not weaken the sense of nationhood, accounting for 11.94%. The table provides a clear breakdown of opinions on this matter, offering insights into the diverse perspectives within the surveyed population.

**Table 4: Nationhood**

Row Labels	Count of Age	Percentage
1	34	50.75%
2	25	37.31%
3	8	11.94%
Grand Total	67	100.00%

In Category 3, the majority of respondents (46 individuals, representing 68.66% of the total count) provided their interpretation of national identity. Category 1, with 13 individuals, constitutes 19.40%, while Category 2, with 8 individuals, represents 11.94%. These percentages indicate the distribution of responses across age groups, shedding light on the varying perspectives on national identity within the surveyed population.

**Table 5: Nationhood and national integration**

Row Labels	Count of Age	Percentage
1	51	76.12%
2	7	10.45%
3	9	13.43%
Grand Total	67	100.00%

A substantial majority of respondents in Category 1 (51 individuals, making up 76.12% of the total count) expressed the belief that a sense of nationhood does lead to national integration.

Category 2, with 7 individuals, represents 10.45%, while Category 3, with 9 individuals, constitutes 13.43%. These percentages indicate a prevalent sentiment across age groups that a strong sense of nationhood contributes positively to the process of national integration.

**Table 6: National integration**

Row Labels	Count of Age	Percentage
1	4	5.97%
2	26	38.81%
3	37	55.22%
Grand Total	67	100.00%

In Category 3, the majority of respondents (37 individuals, representing 55.22% of the total count) provided their interpretation of national integration. Category 2, with 26 individuals, constitutes 38.81%, while Category 1, with 4 individuals, represents 5.97%. These percentages indicate the distribution of responses across age groups, offering insights into the varying perspectives on national integration within the surveyed population.

**Table 7: Socio-political and economic grievances**

Row Labels	Count of Age	Percentage
1	33	49.25%
2	10	14.93%
3	24	35.82%
Grand Total	67	100.00%

In Category 1, the majority of respondents (33 individuals, constituting 49.25% of the total count) expressed agreement that socio-political and economic grievances play a significant role in shaping the quest for identity among ethnic groups. Category 3, with 24 individuals, represents 35.82%, while Category 2, with 10 individuals, makes up 14.93%.

**Table 8: Devolving politics of ethnicity**

Row Labels	Count of Age	Percentage
1	45	67.16%
2	10	14.93%
3	12	17.91%
Grand Total	67	100.00%

In Category 1, a significant majority of respondents (45 individuals, making up 67.16% of the total count) believe that state policies play a role in devolving politics of ethnicity. Category 3, with 12 individuals, constitutes 17.91%, while Category 2, with 10 individuals, represents 14.93%.

**Table 9: Mobilization of ethnic group**

Row Labels	Count of Age	Percentage
1	52	77.61%
2	5	7.46%
3	10	14.93%
Grand Total	67	100.00%

In Category 1, the majority of respondents (52 individuals, representing 77.61% of the total count) believe that strong leadership has the capacity to effectively mobilize an ethnic group. Category 3, with 10 individuals, constitutes 14.93%, while Category 2, with 5 individuals, represents 7.46%. These percentages demonstrate a prevailing sentiment, particularly in Category 1, that attributes significant influence to strong leadership in effectively mobilizing ethnic groups.

**Table 10: Threat to national integration**

Row Labels	Count of Age	Percentage
1	25	37.31%
2	28	41.79%
3	14	20.90%
Grand Total	67	100.00%

In the survey, respondents in Category 2 (28 individuals, representing 41.79% of the total count) believe that a particular ethnic group holds the highest intensity of conflict and poses a significant threat to national integration. Category 1, with 25 individuals, constitutes 37.31%, while Category 3, with 14 individuals, represents 20.90%.

**Table 11: Harmful for national Integration**

Row Labels	Count of Age	Percentage
1	28	41.79%
2	16	23.88%
3	23	34.33%
Grand Total	67	100.00%

In the survey, respondents in Category 1 (28 individuals, making up 41.79% of the total count) identified a specific factor they perceive as harmful to national integration. Category 3, with 23 individuals, represents 34.33%, while Category 2, with 16 individuals, constitutes 23.88%. These percentages demonstrate diverse opinions across age groups on factors considered detrimental to national integration.

**Table 12: Attribute of ethnicity**

Row Labels	Count of Age	Percentage
1	22.39%	22.39%
2	47.76%	47.76%
3	29.85%	29.85%
Grand Total	100.00%	100.00%

In the survey, respondents in Category 2 (32 individuals, representing 47.76% of the total count) believe that a specific attribute of ethnicity holds the most critical significance for national integration. Category 3, with 20 individuals, constitutes 29.85%, while Category 1, with 15 individuals, represents 22.39%. These percentages illustrate the varying perspectives across age groups on the attribute deemed most crucial for national integration.

### Recommendation

To promote a sense of national integration, the central government should emphasize the following:

- The most fundamental recommendation is for the federal government to begin developing plans for equitable allocation of resources and economic policies across all provinces, with no room for bias or hate speech.
- There must be adequate Baloch representation in the federal government to consider them part of Pakistan.
- Political and legal instability is also a major cause of national integration.
- Balochies should be the focus of policies tailored to their region and temperament to create the idea of national integration in the province. Pakistan's national integration concerns in relation to Balochistan 212.
- The federal government should stop terrorist groups in Pakistan from their terrorist activities; stricter anti-terrorist laws may be introduced for this purpose.

- All major and profitable government programs must be made available to the Baloch people, enabling them to participate in the massive government initiatives of the province along with the people of other provinces. The government recognizes that it has ignored Balochistan in the past, but now it is necessary to address the real grievances of the people in the form of social and fiscal progress.

- The law implemented institutes, should take necessary measures to overcome the activities across the border with Afghanistan. Especially, when they cross the border for unlawful activities.

### Conclusion

Establishing a unified society and achieving national cohesion are difficult tasks. It continues to pose a serious threat to multiple societies worldwide, both established and emerging. The nation-building process that promotes national integration is threatened for a number of reasons. Among the most significant causes are ethnic politics. Apart from the fact that ethnicity fosters a "sense of unity" that makes it safe for national cohesion; the threat comes from ethnic politics. Group emotions change to support the expression of their demands and the securing of their rights. The conceptual and philosophical foundations of ethnicity and ethnic politics have been debated by academics for decades. Primitivists, who hold that race, color, religion, language, and territory are basic indicators of identity, have their own theories in this regard. Ethnicity cannot be changed, they said. Social constructivists and instrumentalists in the other two groups, on the other hand, think that ethnicity is not embedded in nature. According to instrumentalists, ethnic associations are shaped by political and economic reasons, but social constructivists see ethnicity as a tool to achieve goals. It focuses on how well leaders meet their demands. Critics of both theories argue that social constructivists and instrumentalists lack a firm foundation unlike primordial lists. Their claims are based on the existence of various economic and socio-political goals. Ethnic feelings disappear after these goals are met. In addition to the issue of ethnicity, the study focuses on ethnic politics, which can be harmful. A number of academics who have written about the idea of ethnic politics believe that the political stance of nationalism helps to mobilize the ethnic community. He argues that ethnic groupings have political goals in mind, even though. Conflicts may arise when you waive rights from government authorities. It is easy to recognize the types of conflict that can arise in this situation - inter-ethnic, intra-ethnic or

state. All three types of conflict exist in emerging cultures. However, inter-ethnic and state-sponsored conflicts are most prevalent.

### References

- Amir, S., Sharf, N., & Khan, R. A. (2020). Pakistan's education system: An analysis of education policies and drawbacks. *Electronic Research Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities*, 2.
- Awan, A. G., & Hussain, S. F. (2020). The Role of Quality Education in sustainable development of Pakistan. *Global Journal of Management, Social Sciences and Humanities*, 6(2), 293-319.
- Awan, S., Anthony, N., & Shahbaz, K. (2023). Inclusive and Equitable Quality Education: The Context of Constitution of Pakistan and International Commitments. *Voyage Journal of Educational Studies*, 3(1), 85-95.
- Hashmi, D. R. S. (2020). Ethnic politics: An issue to National integration (The case of Pakistan). *South Asian Studies*, 29(1).
- Jahantab, Z. (2021). Role of education in national development. *Pakistan Journal of Applied Social Sciences*, 12(1), 87-108.
- Khan, T., Österman, K., & Björkqvist, K. (2023). Severity and reasons behind religious intolerance in Pakistan: Perceptions of Sunnis, Shias, Ahmadis, and Christians. *Humanities Today: Proceedings*, 2(1), 73-87.
- Li, X., Abbas, J., Baig, N. U. A., & Zhang, R. (2022). From cultural tourism to social entrepreneurship: Role of social value creation for environmental sustainability. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 13, 925768.
- Mangi, S. N., Shah, A. M., & Malik, A. (2021). Educational Stratification and nation building process in Pakistan. *Pakistan Perspectives*, 26(1), 5.
- Mehfooz, M. (2021). Religious freedom in Pakistan: A case study of religious minorities. *Religions*, 12(1), 51.
- Rahman, K. (2021). Attitudes towards Religious minorities in Pakistan: Gaps in the literature and future directions. *Pakistan Languages and Humanities Review*, 5(2), 345-359.
- Syed, J., & Ali, F. (2021). A pyramid of hate perspective on religious bias, discrimination and violence. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 172, 43-58.
- Tabassum, S., & Bhatti, G. M. D. M. N. (2020). Issues of national integration in Pakistan with reference to Balochistan. *Pakistan Social Sciences Review*, 4(1), 204-215.